

**MINUTES**  
**ISLANDS PLANNING COMMISSION**  
**JULY 19, 2016 - 6:00 P.M.**  
**St. Williams Catholic Church, SSI**

---

MEMBERS PRESENT:   Desiree Watson, Vice Chairman  
                          Stan Humphries  
                          Preston Kirkendall  
                          William Lawrence  
                          Joel Willis

ABSENT:               Ed Ellis

STAFF PRESENT:       David Hainley, Community Development Director  
                          Will Worley, Senior Assistant County Attorney  
                          Cayce Dagenhart, Planner II  
                          Janet Loving, Admin/Recording Secretary

ALSO PRESENT:       Dale Provenzano, County Commissioner  
                          Alan Ours, County Manager

---

Vice Chairman Desiree Watson called the meeting to order and the invocation was given by Mr. William Lawrence who also acknowledged the recent passing of Ms. Karen Ward. This was immediately followed by the Pledge of Allegiance. Ms. Watson then gave a brief recap of the rules, voting procedure and audience participation in discussing agenda items.

---

MINUTES

**June 21, 2016 - IPC Regular Meeting**

**June 14, 2016 - IPC/MPC Joint Meeting**

A motion was made by Mr. Joel Willis to approve the Minutes of the **June 21<sup>st</sup> Regular Meeting**. The motion was seconded by Mr. Stan Humphries. Voting Aye: Mr. Stan Humphries, Mr. Preston Kirkendall, Ms. Desiree Watson and Mr. Joel Willis. Abstained From Voting: Mr. William Lawrence.

A motion was made by Mr. Preston Kirkendall to approve the Minutes of the **June 14<sup>th</sup> Joint Meeting**. The motion was seconded by Mr. Stan Humphries. Voting Aye: Mr. Stan Humphries, Mr. Preston Kirkendall, Mr. William Lawrence and Mr. Joel Willis. Abstained From Voting: Ms. Desiree Watson.

---

**AGENDA - Additions, Deferrals, Deletions, Postponements, Adjustments**

Upon the applicant's request, a motion was made by Mr. Preston Kirkendall, seconded by Mr. William Lawrence and unanimously adopted to defer Application **SUP3306**, Weber's Growler Factory, until the August 16<sup>th</sup> IPC Meeting beginning at 6:00 p.m.

Upon the applicant's request, a motion was made by Mr. Joel Willis, seconded by Mr. Preston Kirkendall and unanimously adopted to defer Application **SP3299**, Dollar General, until the August 16<sup>th</sup> IPC Meeting beginning at 6:00 p.m.

It was announced that there would be no public comments taken on either of these items tonight. Public comments will be accepted at the August 16<sup>th</sup> IPC Meeting.

Upon staff's request, a motion was made by Mr. Stan Humphries, seconded by Mr. Joel Willis and unanimously adopted to rearrange the agenda and move Application **VP3310** up first for discussion.

-----

**VP3310 - 628 May Joe Street:** Consider Village Preservation application approval for the expansion of a master bedroom as a part of a single-family home at 628 May Joe Street. The lot is on the west corner of May Joe Street and Oleander Street. Parcel ID: 04-04736. John Williams, applicant and owner.

Mr. James Roberts was present for discussion.

The following report from staff was included in the packages for review and was presented by Ms. Cayce Dagenhart:

The applicant would like to expand the master bedroom in his current residence by 230 sq. ft. The expanded bedroom will be painted to match the rest of the house and have two new vinyl DH widows installed.

Section 709.4 in the Island Preservation District gives the standards for review, as follows:

(a) Construction, or remodeling or enlargement of an existing building in a manner inconsistent with the existing building massing (the three-dimensional bulk of a building: height, width, and depth), articulation (the pattern of the building base, middle and top, created by variations in detailing, color and materials or stepping back or extending forward a portion of the facade) and fenestration (the arrangement, proportioning, and design of windows and doors in a building) in the immediate area; or

(b) An absence of unity or coherence in composition which is in opposition to the character of the present structure in the case of repair; or

(c) Violent contrasts of materials or intense colors not representative of the existing buildings in the immediate area; or

(d) A multiplicity or incongruity of details resulting in a disturbing appearance.

Ms. Dagenhart stated that staff has determined that this application is complete and contains the necessary information required by Section 709 of the Glynn County Zoning Ordinance.

Following a brief presentation by Mr. James Roberts, the floor was opened for public comments beginning with Mr. Julian Smith who questioned the findings presented by staff. It was pointed out to Mr. Smith that the findings listed under Section 709.4 are items or criteria by which the Planning Commissioners base their action for approval or denial.

There being no further comments, the public hearing was closed and a motion was made by Mr. Stan Humphries for approval of Application **VP3310**. The motion was seconded by Mr. Preston Kirkendall and unanimously adopted.

-----

**SP3176 - Pilar Hotel:** Consider a request for site plan approval for a new three-story, 21 unit hotel located at 1200 Ocean Boulevard on St. Simons Island. This property is zoned HC Highway Commercial and is located at the intersection of Ocean Boulevard and Neptune Road. Parcel ID: 04-14178. Larry Bryson, agent, for The Oaks Cottages Partners, LLC, applicants and owners.

Messrs. Larry Bryson, Johnathan Roberts and Burt Ethridge were present for discussion.

According to the staff's report, the applicant's proposal is for a three-story hotel with a 7,834 sq. ft. building footprint (18,584 total sq. ft. of building area) with parking underneath to be constructed in a single phase. The total site area is .44 acres, .30 acres of which will be impervious. Thirty (30) parking spaces are required for the proposed uses and thirty (30) spaces are provided, including two ADA compliant spaces. The applicant is providing the required Type "E" Buffer along the front property line and the required Type "A" Buffer along the rear property line. In addition, the applicant is placing a 10 ft. tall privacy fence behind the rear buffer to screen the garage parking area.

Under Section 619.4 (a) of the Zoning Ordinance, the Planning Commission's review shall be guided by the following standards and criteria:

1. The application, site plan, and other submitted information contains all of the items required under this Section. ***Staff comment: This requirement has been met.***

2. The proposed uses, buildings and structures are in accordance with the requirements of this ordinance and other ordinances of Glynn County. *Staff comment: This requirement has been met. Staff notes that while the applicant's revised site plan shows a reduction in the number of units, the proposed use remains in compliance with the density provisions of the Future Land Use Map (FLUM) as set forth in the Glynn County Comprehensive Plan. The project site has a FLUM designation of Medium Density Residential (MDR). The MDR FLUM designation provides for "areas that are suitable for moderate density housing between four (4) and ten (10) dwelling units per net acre." This project proposes twenty-one (21) units on .44 acres or forty-eight (48) units per net acre. Furthermore, the FLUM states that development proposals ". . . at the high end of the range of densities shall be encouraged in areas where adequate services and facilities can accommodate such densities and where such proposed densities do not adversely affect the stability of existing residential uses."*

*This parcel retains its original zoning of Highway Commercial (HC) which was assigned to it in 1966. A hotel is an allowed use in the HC zoning district. There is, however, a significant divergence between the Future Land Use Map designation and the existing zoning of this parcel. The presence of this zoning district on St. Simons Island is inconsistent with the Future Land Use Map; and it is incompatible with the scale and character of the surrounding neighborhood.*

*Finally, staff notes that this project, due to its density, may conflict with the stated goals of the Preamble and Enactment Clause of the Glynn County Zoning Ordinance. Specifically, this portion of the Ordinance states its purposes to include "lessening congestion in the streets;... preventing the overcrowding of land; avoiding undue concentration of population; ... and regulating with reasonable consideration, among other things, the character of the various districts and their peculiar suitability for particular uses, with a view to promoting desirable living conditions and the sustained stability of neighborhood ... (and) conserving the value of buildings and encouraging the most appropriate use of the land."*

3. Adequate provisions are made for ingress and egress, off-street parking, loading, and the flow of traffic, which may reasonably be anticipated. *Staff comment: The applicant has provided the minimum standards necessary to comply with this requirement regarding access and traffic flow. The intensity of the proposed use would bring an additional 210 average trips per day to this area, as calculated by the Trip Generation metrics provided by the International Traffic Engineers manual.*
4. Adequate provisions are made to control the flow of storm water from and across the site. *Staff comment: This requirement has been met by the applicant proposing underground detention.*

5. Adequate provisions are made to protect trees that are selected to remain as depicted on the site plan. *Staff comment: The applicant states that adequate provisions will be made to protect trees proposed for retention. Any trees proposed for retention that are damaged or intentionally removed shall constitute a violation of any site plan approval and shall require the applicant to present a modified site plan for approval to the Islands Planning Commission prior to recommencing any construction activities.*
  
6. Adequate provisions are made to buffer intensive uses and to screen all service areas from view of the adjacent properties and streets. *Staff comment: This requirement has been met. The applicant's revised plan proposes a full Type "A" Buffer as described in Section 613.2(3) (a). The applicant has also provided information on the site plan that meets the minimum required plantings as required in Section 613.2(3) (a) and has also incorporated a 10 ft. tall fence which is not required in the standard buffer. However, Staff does not believe that the applicant's proposed buffer meets the intent of this section as outlined in the Ordinance. Section 613.1 "Purpose and Intent" reads as follows:*

*"Buffers shall be required between incompatible land uses and zoning districts, around particular visually objectionable structures and between certain land uses located along certain streets in order to provide separation and privacy and to reduce the impact of noise, debris, and undesirable lighting to adjacent properties and streets."*

*The fence that the applicant has proposed to construct would stand 10 ft. tall per the submitted plans. The hotel would be 37.67 ft. tall from existing grade to the crown of the roof; and the top of the lower-level parking area would be 8.67 ft. tall. In a parking area such as this, lighting is typically installed on the ceiling. This would mean that the lower-level parking area would be screened and the remainder of the physical structure of the hotel would be plainly visible to the residential areas behind the property. As a note, the Glynn County Zoning Ordinance measures building height from the greater of either the average natural grade of the building footprint or the Base Flood Elevation (AE-12 for this project). Therefore, the proposed building elevation is 37.67 ft. from grade but measured as 35 ft. per GCZO definitions.*

*The adjacent properties to the rear are zoned Resort Residential and are currently occupied by single-family dwellings. The intensity of the proposed commercial hotel use for this site is not compatible with adjacent residential uses. While the applicant has provided a full Type "A" buffer, staff believes that the minimum required plantings do not provide sufficient screening and that additional plantings are required in order to meet the intent of "adequate provisions" as described in this requirement. The applicant has not shown any enhanced plantings for the buffer either in size or quantity.*

7. Adequate provisions are made to control the location, intensity, and direction of all outdoor lighting so that it will not have an adverse effect upon adjoining properties. ***Staff comment: The applicant states that this project will comply with all outdoor lighting requirements.***
8. Open space, as required, has been provided and appropriate means are proposed to assure maintenance of common areas and facilities. ***Staff comment: The Highway Commercial Zoning District is outlined in Section 713 of the Ordinance. This section of the Ordinance has no prescribed open space requirement. Therefore, this requirement is not applicable.***
9. Adequate provisions are made for water supply, fire protection, and sewage collection and treatment. ***Staff comment: This requirement has been met by their proposal to JWSC and the note on the site plan. The site plan indicates that water and sewer will be provided by JWSC which notes in their review comments that pump station 2002 is currently operating above capacity. As a condition of approval, the applicant would be required to facilitate the necessary improvements to the pump station. Until such time as sufficient downstream capacity is available, "... it is the position of the JWSC that wastewater flow from this development will not be allowed to discharge to the collection system." JWSC has also provided a memo noting that issues exist with regard to sanitary sewer capacity and adequate water main size for fire protection to the site.***

During Mr. Hainley's power-point presentation, he referred to the Tree Advisory Board's findings as well as the following e-mail submitted by Mr. Todd Kline of the JWSC regarding this request:

"As previously noted in JWSC Infor comments, PS2002 (pump station 2002) currently does not have capacity to accept new connections. The JWSC Master Plan designates it may be up to five years before PS2002 is upgraded. The JWSC has implemented a policy to facilitate private actions to improve public infrastructure. The developer for this project has initiated the process to submit an Unsolicited Proposal and has expressed a desire to alleviate the capacity issues at PS2002 for which they would bear the entire cost. The JWSC would approve the proposed connection to the system if the basin improvements are completed per JWSC requirements and contractual agreement. Until such time that basin improvements are made and the capacity issue is resolved, no new connections will be permitted."

At the end of Mr. Hainley's presentation, Mr. Jonathan Roberts gave a detailed report and answered questions. He then introduced Mr. Burt Ethridge and Mr. Larry Bryson who were also present to answer questions and provide additional information.

It was noted that site plan applications do not require public input; however, there were approximately 40 to 50 residents in attendance who were opposed to this request.

Although some of the Planning Commission members commended the applicants for listening and addressing previous issues associated with this request, concerns were expressed regarding property rights, public interest, public safety and the affects that a proposed hotel would have on the stability of the neighborhood. At the end of discussion, a motion was made by Mr. Stan Humphries to deny application *SP3176*, Pilar Hotel, based upon findings that the proposed plan fails to comply with the requirements of Section 619.4(a). The motion was seconded by Mr. William Lawrence. Voting Aye: Mr. Stan Humphries, Mr. William Lawrence and Ms. Desiree Watson. Voting Nay: Mr. Preston Kirkendall and Mr. Joel Willis. The motion carried for denial.

-----

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 7:00 p.m.